Additional Exercises for Introduction to Nonlinear Optimization Amir Beck March 16, 2017

Chapter 1 - Mathematical Preliminaries

1.1 Let $S \subseteq \mathbb{R}^n$.

- (a) Suppose that T is an open set satisfying $T \subseteq S$. Prove that $T \subseteq int(S)$.
- (b) Prove that the complement of int(S) is the closure of the complement of S.
- (c) Do S and cl(S) always have the same interiors?
- 1.2 For any $\mathbf{x} \in \mathbb{R}^n$ and any nonzero vector $\mathbf{d} \in \mathbb{R}^n$, compute the directional derivative $f'(\mathbf{x}; \mathbf{d})$ of

$$f(\mathbf{x}) = |||\mathbf{x} - \mathbf{a}||_2 - \delta| + \max\{\mathbf{c}_1^T \mathbf{x} + \beta_1, \mathbf{c}_2^T \mathbf{x} + \beta_2\},\$$

where $\mathbf{a}, \mathbf{c}_1, \mathbf{c}_2 \in \mathbb{R}^n$ and $\delta \in \mathbb{R}_{++}, \beta_1, \beta_2 \in \mathbb{R}$.

Chapter 2 - Optimality Conditions for Unconstrained Optimization

2.1 For each of the following matrices determine, without computing eigenvalues, the interval of α for which they are positive definite/negative definite/positive semidefinite/negative semidefinite:

(a)
$$\mathbf{B}_{\alpha} = \begin{pmatrix} -1 & \alpha & -1 \\ \alpha & -4 & \alpha \\ -1 & \alpha & -1 \end{pmatrix}.$$

(b)
$$\mathbf{E}_{\alpha} = \begin{pmatrix} 1 & \alpha & 0 & 0 \\ \alpha & 2 & \alpha & 0 \\ 0 & \alpha & 2 & \alpha \\ 0 & 0 & \alpha & 1 \end{pmatrix}.$$

2.2 Let $\mathbf{A} \in \mathbb{R}^{n \times n}$ be a symmetric matrix. Assume that there exist two indices $i \neq j$ for which $A_{jj}, A_{ij} \neq 0$ and $A_{ii} = 0$. Prove that \mathbf{A} is indefinite.

2.3 Let
$$f(x_1, x_2) = x_1^2 - 2x_1x_2^2 + \frac{1}{2}x_2^4$$
.

- (a) Is the function f coercive? explain your answer.
- (b) Find the stationary points of f and classify them (strict/nonstrict local/global minimum/maximum or a saddle point).

2.4 Consider the function $f(x, y) = x^2 - x^2y^2 + y^4$. Find all the stationary points of f and classify them (strict/non-strict, local/global, minimum/maximum or a saddle point).

Chapter 3 - Least Squares

3.1 Let $\mathbf{A} \in \mathbb{R}^{m \times n}$, $\mathbf{b} \in \mathbb{R}^m$, $\mathbf{L} \in \mathbb{R}^{p \times n}$ and $\lambda \in \mathbb{R}_{++}$. Consider the function

$$f(\mathbf{x}) = \|\mathbf{A}\mathbf{x} - \mathbf{b}\|_2^2 + \lambda \|\mathbf{L}\mathbf{x}\|_1.$$

- (a) Show that if f is coercive, then $\text{Null}(\mathbf{A}) \cap \text{Null}(\mathbf{L}) = \{\mathbf{0}\}.$
- (b) Show that the contrary also holds, i.e., if $Null(\mathbf{A}) \cap Null(\mathbf{L}) = \{\mathbf{0}\}$ then f is coercive.

Chapter 6 - Convex Sets

6.1 Show that the following set is not convex:

$$S = \{ \mathbf{x} \in \mathbb{R}^2 : 3x_1^2 + x_2^2 + 4x_1x_2 - x_1 + 4x_2 \le 10 \}.$$

- 6.2 (a) Prove that the extreme points of $\Delta_n = \{\mathbf{x} : \sum_{i=1}^n x_i = 1, x_i \ge 0\}$ are given by $\{\mathbf{e}_1, \mathbf{e}_2, \dots, \mathbf{e}_n\}.$
 - (b) For each of the following sets specify the corresponding extreme points:
 - (i) $\{\mathbf{x} : \mathbf{e}^T \mathbf{x} \le 1, \mathbf{x} \ge \mathbf{0}\}.$
 - (ii) $B[\mathbf{c}, r]$ where $\mathbf{c} \in \mathbb{R}^n$ and r > 0.
 - (iii) $\{(x_1, x_2)^T : 9x_1^2 + 16x_2^2 + 24x_1x_2 6x_1 8x_2 + 1 \le 0, x_1 \ge 0, x_2 \ge 0\}.$

Chapter 7 - Convex Functions

7.1 Find the optimal solution of the problem

$$\max_{\mathbf{x}\in\mathbb{R}^3} \quad 2x_1^2 + x_2^2 - x_3^2 + 2x_1 - 3x_2 + 4x_3$$

s.t.
$$x_1 + x_2 + x_3 = 1$$
$$x_1, x_2, x_3 \ge 0$$

7.2 Let $f : \mathbb{R}^n \to \mathbb{R}$ be convex, and let $\mathbf{A} \in \mathbb{R}^{m \times n}$ be an $m \times n$ matrix. Consider the function h defined as follows:

$$h(\mathbf{y}) = \min_{\mathbf{x}} \{ f(\mathbf{x}) : \mathbf{A}\mathbf{x} = \mathbf{y} \},\$$

where we assume that $h(\mathbf{y}) > -\infty$ for all \mathbf{y} . Show that h is convex.

Chapter 8 - Convex Optimization

8.1 Consider the problem

min max{
$$|x_1 - x_2|, |x_2 - x_3|, |x_1 - x_3|$$
} + $x_1^2 + 2x_2^2 + 3x_3^2 - 2x_2x_3$
s.t. $(4x_1^2 + 6x_2^2 - 2x_1x_2 + 1)^4 + \frac{x_3^2}{x_1 + x_2} \le 150$
 $x_1 + x_2 \ge 1$

- (a) Show that it is convex.
- (b) Write a CVX code that solves it.
- (c) Write down the optimal solution (by running CVX).
- 8.2 Consider the following convex optimization problem:

$$\min_{\substack{x_1^2 + 4x_1x_2 + 3x_2^2 + 1 \\ \text{s.t.}}} \sqrt{\frac{2x_1^2 + 4x_1x_2 + 3x_2^2 + 1}{2} + 7} \\ \frac{(x_1^2 + x_2^2)^2 + 1)^2 \le 100x_1}{\frac{x_1^2 + 4x_2^2 + 4x_1x_2}{2x_1 + x_2 + x_3}} \le 10 \\ 1 \le x_1, x_2, x_3 \le 10.$$

- (a) Prove that the problem is convex.
- (b) Write a CVX code for solving the problem.
- 8.3 Prove that the following problem is convex in the sense that it consists of minimizing a convex function over a convex feasible set.

min
$$\log (e^{x_1-x_2} + e^{x_2+x_3})$$

s.t. $x_1^2 + x_2^2 + 2x_3^2 + 2x_1x_2 + 2x_1x_3 + 2x_2x_3 \le 1$,
 $(x_1 + x_2 + 2x_3)(2x_1 + 4x_2 + x_3)(x_1 + x_2 + x_3) \ge 1$,
 $e^{e^{x_1}} + [x_2]_+^3 \le 7$,
 $x_1, x_2, x_3 \ge \frac{1}{10}$.

8.4 Consider the problem

$$\begin{array}{ll} \min & ax_1^2 + bx_2^2 + cx_1x_2 \\ (\mathbf{Q}) \text{ s.t.} & 1 \le x_1 \le 2, \\ & 0 \le x_2 \le x_1. \end{array}$$

where $a, b, c \in \mathbb{R}$.

- (a) Prove that there exists a minimizer for problem (Q).
- (b) Prove that if a < 0, b < 0 and $c^2 4ab \le 0$, then the optimal value of problem (Q) is

$$4\min\{a, a+b+c\}.$$

(c) Prove that if a > 0, b > 0 and $c^2 > 4ab$, then problem (Q) has a unique solution.

8.5 Consider the optimization problem

(P) min
$$\sqrt{x_1^2 + 4x_1x_2 + 5x_2^2 + 2x_1 + 6x_2 + 5} - \frac{x_2}{x_2 + 1}$$

(P) s.t. $(|x_1 - 1| + |x_2 - 1|)^2 + \frac{x_1^4 - x_2^2}{x_1^2 + x_2} \le 7$
 $x_2 \ge 1.$

- (a) Prove that $x_1^2 + 4x_1x_2 + 5x_2^2 + 2x_1 + 6x_2 + 5 \ge 0$ for any x_1, x_2 .
- (b) Prove that problem (P) is convex.
- (c) Write a CVX code that solves the problem.
- 8.6 Consider the problem

(P)
$$\max\{g(\mathbf{y}): f_1(\mathbf{y}) \le 0, f_2(\mathbf{y}) \le 0\},\$$

where $g : \mathbb{R}^n \to \mathbb{R}$ is concave and $f_1, f_2 : \mathbb{R}^n \to \mathbb{R}$ are convex. Assume that the problem $\max\{g(\mathbf{y}) : f_1(\mathbf{y}) \leq 0\}$ has a unique solution $\tilde{\mathbf{y}}$. Let Y^* be the optimal set of problem (P). Prove that exactly one of the following two options holds:

- (i) $f_2(\tilde{\mathbf{y}}) \leq 0$ and in this case $Y^* = \{\tilde{\mathbf{y}}\}.$
- (ii) $f_2(\tilde{\mathbf{y}}) > 0$ and in this case $Y^* = \arg\max\{g(\mathbf{y}) : f_1(\mathbf{y}) \le 0, f_2(\mathbf{y}) = 0\}$.
- 8.7 Show that the following optimization problem can be cast as a convex optimization problem and write a CVX code for solving it.

$$\min \quad \frac{4x_1^2 + 2x_1x_2 + 5x_2^2}{x_1 + x_2} + (x_1^2 + x_2^2 + 1)^2 \\ \text{s.t.} \quad \frac{x_1}{x_1 + 1} + \frac{x_2}{x_2 + 1} \ge 1 \\ x_1^2 \le x_2 \sqrt{2x_1 + 3x_2} \\ x_1, x_2 \ge 1.$$

8.8 Show that the following is a convex optimization problem and write a CVX code for solving it.

$$\min \begin{array}{l} x_1^2 + (4x_1 + 5x_2)^2 - (3x_1 + 4x_2 + 1)^2 \\ \text{s.t.} \quad \sqrt{x_1^2 + x_2^2 + 1} \le \sqrt{x_2} \\ \frac{x_1^2 - x_2^2}{x_2} \le \min\{x_2 - |x_1 + 3x_2|, 7\} \\ x_2 \ge 1. \end{array}$$

Chapter 9 - Optimization over a Convex Set

9.1 Consider the set

$$\operatorname{Box}[\boldsymbol{\ell}, \mathbf{u}] \equiv \{ \mathbf{x} \in \mathbb{R}^n : \ell_i \le x_i \le u_i, i = 1, 2, \dots, n \}$$

where $\ell, \mathbf{u} \in \mathbb{R}^n$ are given vectors that satisfy $\ell \leq \mathbf{u}$. Consider the minimization problem

(P)
$$\min\{f(\mathbf{x}) : \mathbf{x} \in \operatorname{Box}[\boldsymbol{\ell}, \mathbf{u}]\},\$$

where f is continuously differentiable function over $Box[\ell, \mathbf{u}]$. Prove that $\mathbf{x}^* \in Box[\ell, \mathbf{u}]$ is a stationarity point of (P) if and only if

$$\frac{\partial f}{\partial x_i}(\mathbf{x}^*) \begin{cases} = 0, & l_i < x_i^* < u_i \\ \leq 0, & x_i^* = u_i, \\ \geq 0, & x_i^* = l_i. \end{cases}$$

9.2 In the "source localization problem"¹ we are given m locations of sensors $\mathbf{a}_1, \mathbf{a}_2, \ldots, \mathbf{a}_m \in \mathbb{R}^n$ and approximate distances between the sensors and an unknown "source" located at $\mathbf{x} \in \mathbb{R}^n$:

$$d_i \approx \|\mathbf{x} - \mathbf{a}_i\|_2$$

The problem is to find/estimate \mathbf{x} given the locations $\mathbf{a}_1, \mathbf{a}_2, \ldots, \mathbf{a}_m$ and the approximate distances d_1, d_2, \ldots, d_m . The following natural formulation of the problem as a minimization problem was introduced in Exercise 4.5:

$$\min_{\mathbf{x}\in\mathbb{R}^n}\left\{\sum_{i=1}^m (\|\mathbf{x}-\mathbf{a}_i\|_2 - d_i)^2\right\}.$$
 (SL)

(a) Show that the problem given by (SL) is equivalent to the problem

min
$$f(\mathbf{x}, \mathbf{u}_1, \mathbf{u}_2, \dots, \mathbf{u}_m) \equiv \sum_{i=1}^m \|\mathbf{x} - \mathbf{a}_i\|_2^2 - 2d_i \mathbf{u}_i^T (\mathbf{x} - \mathbf{a}_i) + d_i^2$$

s.t. $\|\mathbf{u}_i\|_2 \le 1, i = 1, \dots, m,$
 $\mathbf{x} \in \mathbb{R}^n,$ (SL2)

in the sense that \mathbf{x} is an optimal solution of (SL) if and only if there exists $(\mathbf{u}_1, \mathbf{u}_2, \ldots, \mathbf{u}_m)$ such that $(\mathbf{x}, \mathbf{u}_1, \mathbf{u}_2, \ldots, \mathbf{u}_m)$ is an optimal solution of (SL2).

- (b) Find a Lipschitz constant of the function f.
- (c) Consider the two-dimensional problem (n = 2) with 5 anchors (m = 5) and data generated by the MATLAB commands

```
randn('seed',317);
A=randn(2,5);
x=randn(2,1);
d=sqrt(sum((A-x*ones(1,5)).^2))+0.05*randn(1,5);
d=d';
```

 $^{^1\}mathrm{The}$ description of the problem also appears in Exercise 4.5

The columns of the 2×5 matrix **A** are the locations of the five sensors, **x** is the true location of the source and **d** is the vector of noisy measurements between the source and the sensors. Write a MATLAB function that implements the gradient projection algorithm employed on problem (SL2) for the generated data. Use the following step size selection strategies

- (i) constant step size.
- (ii) backtracking with parameters s = 1, $\alpha = 0.5$, $\beta = 0.5$.

Start both methods with the initial vectors $(1000, -500)^T$ and $\mathbf{u}_i = \mathbf{0}$ for all $i = 1, \ldots, m$. Run both algorithms for 100 iterations and compare their performance.

Chapter 10 - Optimality Conditions for Linearly Constrained Problems

10.1 Let $\mathbf{A} \in \mathbb{R}^{m \times n}$. Prove that the following two claims are equivalent.

(A) The system

$$Ax = 0, x > 0$$

has no solution.

- (B) There exists a vector $\mathbf{y} \in \mathbb{R}^n$ for which $\mathbf{A}^T \mathbf{y} \leq \mathbf{0}$ and $\mathbf{A}^T \mathbf{y}$ is not the zeros vector.
- 10.2 Consider the problem

$$\begin{array}{l} \min_{\mathbf{x}\in\mathbb{R}^n} & \frac{1}{2}\mathbf{x}^T\mathbf{Q}\mathbf{x} + \mathbf{d}^T\mathbf{x} \\ (\mathbf{Q}) \text{ s.t.} & \mathbf{a}_1^T\mathbf{x} \leq b_1, \\ & \mathbf{a}_2^T\mathbf{x} = b_2, \end{array}$$

where $\mathbf{Q} \in \mathbb{R}^{n \times n}$ $(n \geq 3)$ is positive definite, $\mathbf{d}, \mathbf{a}_1, \mathbf{a}_2 \in \mathbb{R}^n$ and $b_1, b_2 \in \mathbb{R}$. Assume that $\mathbf{a}_1^T \mathbf{Q}^{-1} \mathbf{a}_1 = \mathbf{a}_2^T \mathbf{Q}^{-1} \mathbf{a}_2 = 2, \mathbf{a}_2^T \mathbf{Q}^{-1} \mathbf{a}_1 = 0, \mathbf{a}_1 \neq \mathbf{0}, \mathbf{a}_2 \neq \mathbf{0}$

- (a) Are the KKT conditions necessary and sufficient for problem (Q)? explain your answer.
- (b) Prove that the problem is feasible.
- (c) Write the KKT conditions explicitly.
- (d) Find the optimal solution of the problem.

Chapter 11 - The KKT Conditions

11.1 Consider the problem

$$\begin{array}{ll} \max & x_1^3 + x_2^3 + x_3^3 \\ \text{s.t.} & x_1^2 + x_2^2 + x_3^2 = 1. \end{array}$$

- (a) Is the problem convex?
- (b) Prove that all the local maximum points of the problem are also KKT points.
- (c) Find all the KKT points of the problem.
- (d) Find the optimal solution of the problem.

Chapter 12 - Duality

12.1 Consider the following optimization problem:

$$\min_{\mathbf{x}\in\mathbb{R}^{n},t\in\mathbb{R}} \quad \frac{1}{2} \|\mathbf{x}\|_{2}^{2} + ct$$
s.t.
$$\mathbf{A}\mathbf{x} = \mathbf{b} + t\mathbf{e}$$

$$t \ge 0,$$
(P5)

where $\mathbf{A} \in \mathbb{R}^{m \times n}$, $\mathbf{b} \in \mathbb{R}^m$, $c \in \mathbb{R}$, and as usual \mathbf{e} is the vector of all ones. Assume in addition that the rows of \mathbf{A} are linearly independent.

- (i) Find a dual problem to problem (P5) (do not assign a Lagrange multiplier to the nonnegativity constraint).
- (ii) Solve the dual problem obtained in part (i) and find the optimal solution of problem (P5).
- 12.2 Consider the optimization problem (with the convention that $0 \log 0 = 0$):

min
$$\mathbf{a}^T \mathbf{x} + \sum_{i=1}^n x_i \log x_i$$

s.t. $\mathbf{x} \in \Delta_n$,

where $\mathbf{a} \in \mathbb{R}^n$ and Δ_n is the unit simplex.

- (i) Show that the problem cannot have more than one optimal solution.
- (ii) Find a dual problem in one dual decision variable.
- (iii) Solve the dual problem.
- (iv) Find the optimal solution of the primal problem.
- 12.3 Let $\mathbf{E} \in \mathbb{R}^{k \times n}$, $\mathbf{f} \in \mathbb{R}^n$, $\mathbf{a} \in \mathbb{R}^m$, $\mathbf{A} \in \mathbb{R}^{m \times n}$, $\mathbf{b} \in \mathbb{R}^m$ and $\mathbf{c}_1, \mathbf{c}_2, \dots, \mathbf{c}_p \in \mathbb{R}^n$. Consider the problem

(P)
$$\begin{aligned} \min_{\mathbf{x} \in \mathbb{R}^{n}, \mathbf{z} \in \mathbb{R}^{m}} & \frac{1}{2} \|\mathbf{E}\mathbf{x}\|_{2}^{2} + \frac{1}{2} \|\mathbf{z}\|_{2}^{2} + \mathbf{f}^{T}\mathbf{x} + \mathbf{a}^{T}\mathbf{z} + \sum_{i=1}^{p} e^{\mathbf{c}_{i}^{T}\mathbf{x}} \\ \mathbf{A}\mathbf{x} + \mathbf{z} = \mathbf{b}, \\ & \mathbf{z} \geq \mathbf{0}. \end{aligned}$$

Assume that **E** has full column rank.

- (a) Show that the objective function is coercive.
- (b) Show that if the set $P = {\mathbf{x} \in \mathbb{R}^n : \mathbf{A}\mathbf{x} \leq \mathbf{b}}$ is nonempty, then strong duality holds for problem (P).
- (c) Write a dual problem for problem (P).

12.4 Consider the problem

$$\begin{aligned} \min_{\mathbf{x}, \mathbf{y} \in \mathbb{R}^n} \quad & \sqrt{\|\mathbf{x}\|_2^2 + 4} + \mathbf{a}^T \mathbf{y} + \|\mathbf{x}\|_2 \\ \text{s.t.} \qquad & \mathbf{B} \mathbf{x} + \mathbf{C} \mathbf{y} \leq \mathbf{d}, \\ & \|\mathbf{y}\|_2 \leq 1, \end{aligned}$$

where $\mathbf{a} \in \mathbb{R}^n, \mathbf{B}, \mathbf{C} \in \mathbb{R}^{m \times n}, \mathbf{d} \in \mathbb{R}^m$.

- (a) Show that if $\mathbf{BB}^T \succ \mathbf{0}$, then strong duality holds for the problem.
- (b) Find a dual problem.

12.5 Consider the following convex optimization problem:

(P)
$$\min_{\text{s.t.}} \|\mathbf{A}\mathbf{x} + \mathbf{b}\|_2 + \|\mathbf{L}\mathbf{x}\|_1 + \|\mathbf{M}\mathbf{x}\|_2^2 + \sum_{i=1}^n x_i \log x_i$$

where $\mathbf{A} \in \mathbb{R}^{m \times n}$, $\mathbf{b} \in \mathbb{R}^{m}$, $\mathbf{L} \in \mathbb{R}^{p \times n}$, $\mathbf{M} \in \mathbb{R}^{q \times n}$. Write a dual problem of (P). Do not perform any transformations that ruin the convexity of the problem.

12.6 (a) Prove that for any $\mathbf{a} \in \mathbb{R}^n$, the following holds:

$$\min \mathbf{a}^T \mathbf{x} + \|\mathbf{x}\|_{\infty} = \begin{cases} 0, & \|\mathbf{a}\|_1 \le 1, \\ -\infty, & \text{else.} \end{cases}$$

(b) Consider the following minimization problem:

(P)
$$\min_{\text{s.t.}} \frac{\sqrt{\|\mathbf{A}\mathbf{x}\|_2^2 + 1} + \|\mathbf{x}\|_{\infty}}{\mathbf{B}\mathbf{x} \le \mathbf{c}},$$

where $\mathbf{A} \in \mathbb{R}^{d \times n}$, $\mathbf{B} \in \mathbb{R}^{m \times n}$, $\mathbf{c} \in \mathbb{R}^{m}$. Assume that the problem is feasible. Find a dual problem to (P). Do not perform any transformations that might ruin the convexity of the problem.

12.7 Consider the problem

(G) min
$$\mathbf{x}^T \mathbf{Q} \mathbf{x} + 2\mathbf{b}^T \mathbf{x}$$

s.t. $\mathbf{x}^T \mathbf{Q} \mathbf{x} + 2\mathbf{c}^T \mathbf{x} + d \le 0$

where $\mathbf{Q} \in \mathbb{R}^{n \times n}$ is positive definite, $\mathbf{b}, \mathbf{c} \in \mathbb{R}^n$ and $d \in \mathbb{R}$.

(a) Under which (explicit) condition on the data $(\mathbf{Q}, \mathbf{b}, \mathbf{c}, d)$ is the problem feasible?

- (b) Under which (explicit) condition on the data $(\mathbf{Q}, \mathbf{b}, \mathbf{c}, d)$ does strong duality hold?
- (c) Find a dual problem to (G) in one variable.
- (d) Assume that $\mathbf{Q} = \mathbf{I}$. Find the optimal solution of the primal problem (G) assuming that the condition of part (b) holds. **Hint:** recast the problem as a problem of finding an orthogonal projection of a certain point to a certain set.
- 12.8 Consider the convex problem

(P)
$$\begin{array}{ll} \min_{\mathbf{x}\in\mathbb{R}^n} & \|\mathbf{A}\mathbf{x}-\mathbf{b}\|_1 + \|\mathbf{x}\|_{\infty} - \sum_{i=1}^n \log(x_i) \\ \mathbf{C}\mathbf{x} \leq \mathbf{d}, \\ \mathbf{x} \geq \mathbf{e}, \end{array}$$

where $\mathbf{A} \in \mathbb{R}^{m \times n}$, $\mathbf{b} \in \mathbb{R}^{m}$, $\mathbf{C} \in \mathbb{R}^{p \times n}$, $\mathbf{d} \in \mathbb{R}^{p}$ and \mathbf{e} is the vector of all ones. Find a dual problem of (P). Do not make any transformations that will ruin the convexity of the problem.

12.9 Let $\mathbf{u} \in \mathbb{R}^{n}_{++}$. Consider the problem

$$\min\left\{\sum_{j=1}^{n} x_{j}^{2} : \sum_{j=1}^{n} x_{j} = 1, 0 \le x_{j} \le u_{j}\right\}$$

- (a) Write a necessary and sufficient condition (in terms of the vector **u**) under which the problem is feasible.
- (b) Write a dual problem in one variable.
- (c) Describe an algorithm for solving the optimization problem using the dual problem obtained in part (b).